

REGULAR MEETING
BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
Community Room - Brecksville City Hall
April 6, 2017 Page 1

Present: Michael Harwood, Robert Hotaling, Mayor Hruby, Eric Lahrmer, Ron Payto, Kirk Roman,
Dominic Sciria
Others: Steve Synek, Gerald Wise, and approximately 14 guests

Mr. Hotaling opened the Regular Meeting of the Planning Commission at 7:00 p.m.

APPROVAL OF THE MARCH 9, 2017 PUBLIC HEARING MINUTES ON A SOLAR SYSTEM AT 7778 COACHMAN COURT

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling and seconded by Mr. Harwood that the Planning Commission March 9, 2017 Public Hearing Minutes on a Solar System at 7778 Coachman Court be approved...

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Abstain: Robert Hotaling
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

APPROVAL OF THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF MARCH 9, 2017

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling and seconded by Mr. Harwood that the Planning Commission Regular Meeting Minutes of March 9, 2017 be approved.

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Abstain: Robert Hotaling
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

APPROVAL OF THE WORK SESSION MEETING MINUTES OF MARCH 9, 2017

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling and seconded by Mr. Harwood that the Planning Commission Work Session Meeting Minutes of March 9, 2017 be approved.

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Abstain: Robert Hotaling
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

SIGNS

JENSON MASSAGE THERAPY – 8929 BRECKSVILLE ROAD

Ms. Julie Jenson was present to request a wall sign identifying the new location of her business. Mr. Hotaling noted that the sign request was within Code requirements. Mr. Sciria mentioned that as a rear frontage her request would involve a deviation, unless the Commission chose to consider her location as a second frontage. There was a general consensus to consider the request as a second frontage and move forward with a motion for approval. Mr. Sciria mentioned that the sign lettering was small and would be difficult to read from a distance. Ms. Jenson said she has been in business in Brecksville for five years with an established clientele. She builds her business on referrals and was just looking to direct her current clients to her new site.

REGULAR MEETING
BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
Community Room - Brecksville City Hall
April 6, 2017 Page 2

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling, and seconded by Mr. Harwood, that the Planning Commission approve an 8.75 sq. ft., permanent wall, identification sign for Jenson Massage Therapy LLC at 8929 Brecksville Road, Brecksville, Ohio as described in the application dated March 2, 2017 and shown in the attached drawings.

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Robert Hotaling, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

EDWARD JONES SIGN PACKAGE – 8803 BRECKSVILLE ROAD

Mr. Earl DiMalanta of Fast Signs was present on behalf of the signage request of Edward Jones to identify their new location at Millside Center. He described the wall, door, and two ground replacement signs which were within Code requirements. Commission members had no questions.

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling, and seconded by Mr. Harwood, that the Planning Commission approve, and the Building Department issue permits for a 13.15 sq. ft. permanent, wall, identification sign, a 1.39 sq. ft. door sign and two 2.06 sq. ft. multi-tenant, ground, business name replacement signs for Edward Jones, 8803 Brecksville Road, Brecksville, Ohio 44141, as described in the application dated March 20, 2017, and attached sketches by Fast Signs contingent on the owner's approval.

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Robert Hotaling, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

THE VILLAGE PROJECT SIGN – 8203 SNOWVILLE ROAD

Mr. Jim Scherer of A Sign Above was representing Petros Homes in their request for a project sign for The Village. Mr. Hotaling noted that the sign met Code requirements and there were no questions from Commission members.

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling, and seconded by Mr. Harwood, that the Planning Commission approve, and the Building Department issue a permit for a 20 sq. ft., temporary, ground, project identification sign for The Village Subdivision, located at 8203 Snowville Road, Brecksville, Ohio, as described in the application dated March 22, 2017 and attached sketches.

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Robert Hotaling, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

FOUR SEASONS PHASE V PROJECT SIGN – 12022 HIGHLAND DR.

Mr. Jim Scherer of A Sign Above was representing Petros Homes in their request for a project sign for Four Seasons Phase V. Mr. Hotaling noted that the sign met Code requirements and there were no questions from Commission members.

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling, and seconded by Mr. Harwood, that the Planning Commission approve, and the Building Department issue a permit for a 20 sq. ft., temporary, ground, project identification sign for The Four Seasons Subdivision Phase V, located at 12022 Highland Drive, Brecksville, Ohio, as described in the application dated March 22, 2017 and attached sketches.

REGULAR MEETING
BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
Community Room - Brecksville City Hall
April 6, 2017 Page 3

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Robert Hotaling, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

REPORT OF COUNCIL REPRESENTATIVE - No Report

REPORT OF MAYOR HRUBY - No Report

REPORT OF CITY ENGINEER

Mr. Wise reported that utilities were in for the Four Seasons Phase V and it was expected that paving could begin mid-May. The Village project was also moving forward with curb work commencing in the last week and utility installations scheduled in the next several days.

The Regular Meeting recessed into the Work Session, and reopened to make a motion.

ANDREW'S FRONT YARD SETBACK – 9515 CHIPPEWA ROAD

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling, and seconded by Mr. Harwood, that the Planning Commission will hold a Public Hearing at 7:00 p.m. on Thursday, May 4, 2017 in the Community Room of Brecksville City Hall, 9069 Brecksville Road, Brecksville Ohio to establish a front yard setback of 125' for Permanent Parcel Number 601-37-004, at 9515 Chippewa Road, Brecksville, Ohio 44141.

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Robert Hotaling, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

The Regular Meeting recessed into the Work Session, and reopened to make a motion.

THE OVERLOOK AT HILLBROOK – 7724 HILLBROOK OVAL

It was moved by Mr. Hotaling, and seconded by Mr. Harwood, that the Planning Commission will hold a Public Hearing at 7:05 p.m. on Thursday, May 4, 2017 in the Community Room of Brecksville City Hall, 9069 Brecksville Road, Brecksville Ohio for approval of a new house design in an R-20 PDA to be located at 7724 Hillbrook Oval, Brecksville, Ohio 44141.

ROLL CALL: Ayes: Michael Harwood, Robert Hotaling, Eric Lahrmer, Mayor Hruby, Ron Payto,
Kirk Roman, Dominic Sciria
Nays: None
MOTION CARRIED

The Regular Meeting closed at 8:55 p.m.

THE BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION

ROBERT HOTALING, CHAIRMAN
DOMINIC SCIRIA, VICE CHAIRMAN
KIRK ROMAN, SECRETARY

REGULAR MEETING
BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
Community Room - Brecksville City Hall
April 6, 2017 Page 4

Minutes recorded by Nancy Dimitris

MINUTES OF THE WORK SESSION
BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
Community Room - Brecksville City Hall
April 6, 2017 Page 1

Present: Michael Harwood, Robert Hotaling, Mayor Hruby, Eric Lahrmer, Ron Payto, Kirk Roman,
Dominic Sciria
Others: Steve Synek, Gerald Wise, and approximately 14 guests

Mr. Hotaling opened the Work Session at 7:16 p.m.

ANDREW'S FRONT YARD SETBACK – 9515 CHIPPEWA ROAD

Mr. Frank Rini was present on behalf of the Andrew's request to establish a front yard setback at the Code requirement of 125 ft. for their new home at 9515 Chippewa Road. He said setbacks in the immediate vicinity of the new home ranged from 60 ft. to 370 ft. Commission members had no comments and the Work Session recessed into the Regular Meeting to set a public hearing.

THE OVERLOOK AT HILLBROOK – 7724 HILLBROOK OVAL

Mr. Sean Kramp of United Homes was present requesting a public hearing to approve a new house design for Sublot 5 in the Overlook at Hillbrook. The proposed house would fit within the approved footprint, having similar roof pitches, and use the approved construction materials. The main change would be the addition of a third garage, with all garages facing the street.

Mr. Harwood said that at the time the four home styles were approved for the Overlook at Hillbrook they represented general home footprints. There was an understanding that as the sublots were purchased, the specific plans for each home would need to come back before the Planning Commission for approval.

Mr. Lahrmer had no problem with the roof elevation, but was concerned about the appearance of three garage doors facing the street. Mr. Payto thought it was typical now in larger homes to request three garage doors. He had no issue as long as the appearance of the doors was broken up and not just three garage doors in line. Mr. Ron Tomczyk, 7501 Hillbrook Oval and President of the Hillbrook HOA, was present to object to three garage doors facing front. He said their HOA Board met and they were concerned that all the homes would want three car garages. Their feeling was that 24 front facing garages along the Hillbrook Oval would be overwhelming. Mr. Tomczyk was also concerned that with larger houses there would be more cars parking on the street. The decision was made to set a public hearing where Hillbrook residents would have an opportunity to offer their opinions. The Work Session recessed into the Regular Meeting to set a public hearing.

THE CROSSINGS AT BRECKSVILLE RE-ZONING – 4100 & 4122 ROYALTON ROAD

Present: Winn Bishop, Senior Vice President of Development and Construction for Smith/Packett
Aubury Holmes – Smith/Packett Development Manager
Lee Anne Budzevski – Development Coordinator Smith/Packett
Chris Perkins – CEO of Harmony Senior Services
Dan Neff – Neff & Associates – Project Engineer

Ms. Holmes indicated they had been working on the project plans with the Commission's comments in mind from their March 9th meeting. They had two elevation drawings completed – one at four stories and the other at three stories for comparison purposes. She mentioned that present also this evening were a representative from Harmony Senior Services to review the operations of the senior living facility and the project civil engineer to address construction issues. Ms. Holmes said their wetlands delineation was nearly complete. She mentioned about 100 residents in the surrounding area were invited to a meeting held the previous evening and there was mostly positive input from those present. Major concerns for the residents were providing an adequate buffer, and lighting proliferation.

MINUTES OF THE WORK SESSION
BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
Community Room - Brecksville City Hall
April 6, 2017 Page 2

Mr. Chris Perkins, CEO of Harmony Senior Services, spoke about their objective of fitting into the Brecksville community, as well as fostering a sense of community within the building by locating all the common facilities for dining, recreation and physical therapy in a central location within the building. At full occupancy their payroll would approximate \$2.5-3 million, with 100-130 employees, 45 of whom would be full-time. Harmony currently has 13 open facilities for independent living, assisted living and memory care in four states. Mr. Perkins remarked that their objective was to provide a living arrangement where residents could "age in place". Their independent units of 800-1,200 sq. ft. had bedroom(s), baths, living room and a full kitchen. One meal a day, transportation and activities were provided to independent residents, but no clinical or daily care. Assisted care was divided into four levels of care. The memory unit would be the greatest level of care provided in a secured, keypad entry unit highly staffed by health professionals. A parking space per independent unit would be provided, however their experience was that residents eventually gave up their cars when they realized transportation would be provided for them. A half parking space per unit for the assisted living and memory care residents would be provided, but be very lightly used. Parking for the complex was set at 140. Ms. Holmes indicated full capacity was expected by about 19 months. The average age of residents was 87, and their average stay about 26 months.

Mr. Dan Neff indicated they had some preliminary wetlands reports with the final report expected within a week. Their firm was new to the project and expected immediate priorities to study the orientation of the building to determine traffic patterns, access to the site, storm water management and grading. Responding to a question from Mr. Wise, Mr. Neff expected the building to sit flat on the site. He mentioned that some small retaining walls might be necessary. Mr. Harwood asked how the first floor elevation would compare to the elevation of surrounding homes. Mr. Neff estimated the facilities first floor would be about 4-5 feet lower than the elevation of the homes to the west. Mr. Lahrmer asked about a loop drive to the east that wasn't on the previous plan, which was subsequently added for fire department/safety access.

Commission members were concerned that the 20 ft. buffer on the West side was insufficient. Mr. Neff commented they hoped to increase that buffer by moving the building to the east by perhaps up to an additional 20 ft. That might be possible by installing short retaining walls to the east, or by the sharing of an access drive with the developer of the parcel to the east.

Mr. Harwood asked about the impact of reducing the height of the building to three stories, which would be about a 12 foot reduction in height. Mr. Bishop reiterated his comment made at the last meeting that a compact, four story building was easier on residents walking within the building and promoted socialization. A three story building would increase the square footage of the project from 41,000 sq. ft. to 61,166 sq. ft. by spreading out the complex on the site. Commission members in general found the front rendering at three stories more pleasing than at four stories. They didn't find the overhead schematic of the complex at three stories much different than the four story version. Mr. Hotaling mentioned Breckenridge Village in Willoughby as a senior living facility that involved different levels of senior living in separate buildings with connecting common areas. Mr. Bishop stated that any breakup of the architecture to separate units would not work with their interior community/common area operation plan. They needed to keep the number of units at 186 for the project to be financially feasible. Mr. Payto suggested the building could also be a combination of three and four stories over the grade changes. Mr. Lahrmer pointed out that the majority of the masonry was concentrated in the center of the building. He suggested they spread more brickwork out toward Royalton Road.

In terms of addressing residents' concerns the Commission felt the major issues would involve building height, buffers, lighting pollution, traffic, and noise levels from services to the building from the safety forces, deliveries, and rubbish collection. Mr. Bishop indicated they were very selective in keeping the lighting levels low for their residents, which would be in the best interests of the neighbors also. They would keep lighting levels at minimum, safety levels. Mr. Perkins mentioned that in his previous career in law enforcement he found senior living establishments to not be a drain on public safety forces. Harmony expected to meet with representatives of the City safety forces and follow their procedures.

The Mayor thought there was not enough time from now until a vote on rezoning in November for the Planning Commission to recommend a building plan. His advice would be for Commission members to start by considering first if residential was a good use for the property, then if this specific project was a good residential

use of the property. Mr. Sciria was open to use of the property for senior living as a transition from commercial/retail to the east. He also could support an office/lab use for the property. He said the City needed to be concerned with how the use of the property would be impacted over the next 10-20 years. With a concern about market saturation, Mr. Sciria mentioned that two similar senior facilities were currently being built just minutes away. He asked if a facility of theirs had ever failed and Mr. Bishop knew of no failure. No one wanted to see the facility fail and turn into apartments in the future. Mr. Payto favored the senior living facility over office/lab that would bring more traffic to that area. The point was made that the Commission had rejected every other proposal for that entire area, most of which involved mixed use, including apartments, and an over development of the area.

Mr. Sciria would favor the extension of Kenmar. He was concerned about the visual of the main entrance on the west side and wondered if they had considered flipping the building. Mr. Sciria questioned whether the rear walking path should just be green space. Mr. Bishop responded that the walkway was very functional when visitors came to walk with residents.

Mr. Hotaling asked residents in the audience for their input. Ms. Teresa McGroarty, 4026 Royalton Road, a resident since 1991, was in favor of the senior living but felt the 20 foot buffer was not enough and the mass of the building too great at four stories. She was also concerned about the devaluation of her property. Ms. Jayne Pandy, 9249 Pineview Oval, had no problem with senior living, but also found a 20 foot buffer from her property insufficient.

Mr. Jim Hansler of Windswept Drive was concerned about the mass and height of a four story, 60 ft. high, building next to residential property. He asked if the unit size and common areas could be reduced in size to make a three story building fit into the footprint of the four story plans. Mr. Bishop would not consider reducing the size of the units or common areas. He said they needed to provide a dining seat for each resident and it was important to have the space to encourage residents to be social. Mr. Payto agreed that if the space was not desirable it could end up being an empty building. Mr. Hansler asked if the lot to the east could be purchased to add space to the project. Mr. Bishop reiterated their hope to work with the property owners to the east to perhaps share an access drive so the senior living building could be located further to the east.

Mr. Yakuhchenko of 9241 Pineview Oval bought his property because it was a wooded, dead-end street. All the trees they enjoyed have been removed for development and the noise level increased greatly with the Metro development. Mr. Yakuhchenko had hoped to stay here into his retirement, but now worries the drop in value of his property will impact his ability to sell his house. Ms. Diane Zawadski, 3966 Boxelder, has lived in her home 36 years. She didn't think a business open 24/7 was appropriate next to residential homes. She also mentioned that the noise level has already increased greatly with the removal of the trees for the development of Metro. Ms. Zawadski didn't want the noise of ambulances, dump trucks, garbage trucks, and snow plows added to the noise from the highway she now has to hear.

Mr. Chuck Slusarczyk, 4200 Royalton Road, has lived in his home since 1971. He lives just to the east of the proposed senior living facility and did not receive an invitation to last night's meeting. There were also others in the audience who did not receive an invitation. He wondered how the developer could claim it seemed like most people liked the idea of the proposed development when not everyone was invited to the meeting. The Commission assured him that everyone in the surrounding area would receive a notice from the City when a public hearing was set. Mr. Ted Zawadski, 3966 Boxelder, was concerned for the future if the complex should not succeed and the building became an apartment building. He suggested the complex might be too large for the site and should possibly be scaled back.

Mr. Harwood thought that before a public hearing was scheduled the Commission would like to see a topo, elevation plans for both 3 and 4 stories especially as they relate to the neighboring residents, wetlands plans and a grading plan. Commission members felt the 20 ft. buffer on the west side of the site was insufficient and would be interested in seeing any adjustment that could increase that buffer. Mr. Lahrmer commented that a three story building twice as long may not be better than a four story more compact building. He was interested in any drawings that would help the Commission make that evaluation. The point was made that setting a public hearing

MINUTES OF THE WORK SESSION
BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION
Community Room - Brecksville City Hall
April 6, 2017 Page 4

at the May 4, 2017 Planning Commission Meeting for the May 25, 2017 Planning would fit within the schedule necessary to seek rezoning on the November ballot.

The Work Session closed at 8:55 p.m.

THE BRECKSVILLE PLANNING COMMISSION

ROBERT HOTALING, CHAIRMAN
DOMINIC SCIRIA, VICE CHAIRMAN
KIRK ROMAN, SECRETARY

Minutes recorded by Nancy Dimitris